

## REPORTER

Start from 1 and add/subtract

$$1 + \square + \square - \square = \square$$

| REPORT                       | phenomenon explanation               | theory/model            | relevant experiments   | comparison between theory and experiment | own contribution   | task fulfilment            | science communication        | DISCUSSION WITH OPPONENT  | ANSWERS TO JURY, OPPONENT, and REVIEWER'S QUESTIONS |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
|------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|--|--|--|----------------------------|------------------------------|---|---|---|------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------|---|------|-------------|---|------|------|---|-------------------------|------------------------|---|---------------------------|-------------------|---|
| 0                            | almost no                            | almost no               | almost no  | almost no                                | almost no  | misunderstood              | unclear, chaotic             | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>relevant arguments/responses</th> <th>reporter's conduct at the discussion</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0</td> <td>too few</td> <td>poor</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>some</td> <td>partly fine</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>many</td> <td>good</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>+ data/theory supported</td> <td>some aspects efficient</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>proved deep understanding</td> <td>overall efficient</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | relevant arguments/responses                        | reporter's conduct at the discussion          | 0                            | too few                              | poor | 1 | some | partly fine | 2 | many | good | 3 | + data/theory supported | some aspects efficient | 4 | proved deep understanding | overall efficient | <p>0 ___ concise and correct or no questions asked</p> <p>1 ___ some incorrect, inconclusive or too long</p> <p>2 ___ deeply incorrect or shows deep misconceptions</p> |
| relevant arguments/responses | reporter's conduct at the discussion |                         |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 0                            | too few                              | poor                    |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 1                            | some                                 | partly fine             |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 2                            | many                                 | good                    |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 3                            | + data/theory supported              | some aspects efficient  |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 4                            | proved deep understanding            | overall efficient       |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 1                            | some                                 | some                    | some   | some                                     | review of sources, cited   | partly                     | partly clear                 |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 2                            | fair                                 | fair                    | fair   | qualitative agreement                    | some own input   | average                    | average                      |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 3                            | good                                 | good                    | good   | quantitative agreement                   | + some interesting results   | some aspects above average | some aspects well done       |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 4                            | detailed Demonstrative               | quite detailed, correct | or<br>↕<br>and<br>↕<br>multitude of parametres examined<br>errors analysis | + limits discussed                       | or<br>↕<br>and<br>↕<br>considerable experimental<br>considerable theoretical | interesting solution       | overall clear, demonstrative |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 5                            |                                      |                         |  |  |  |                            |                              | deep and comprehensible, shows physical insight   | detailed, complex, completely testable              | well fitting, deviations analysed, conclusive | greater extent than expected | + complex concepts well communicated |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 6                            |                                      |                         |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |
| 7                            |                                      |                         |  |  |  |                            |                              |   |   |   |                              |                                      |      |   |      |             |   |      |      |   |                         |                        |   |                           |                   |   |

NOTES:

## OPPONENT

Start from 1 and add/subtract

$$1 + \square + \square + \square - \square = \square$$

| QUESTIONS ASKED   | OPPOSITION (SPEECH)  | DISCUSSION WITH REPORTER             | ANSWERS TO JURY and REVIEWER'S QUESTIONS |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
|---|--|--------------------------------------|--|------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|------------|---------|------|------------------------|---------|------|------------|-------------------|------|--------------|------|---------------------------|------|--------------|-----------|------------------------------|------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|--|------------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------|---------|------|---------------|------|-------------------|------------|--------------|------|------------|--------------|------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|---|
| 0 ___ too few, mostly irrelevant                                | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>understanding of presentation</th> <th>relevant topics and prioritisation</th> <th>own opinions presented</th> <th>time management</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0 ___ almost nothing</td> <td>irrelevant</td> <td>too few</td> <td>poor</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 ___ some main points</td> <td>too few</td> <td>some</td> <td>reasonable</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 ___ main points</td> <td>some</td> <td>some correct</td> <td>fair</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 ___ all relevant points</td> <td>most</td> <td>many correct</td> <td>efficient</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4 ___ practically all points</td> <td>well prioritised</td> <td>+ improvement suggestions</td> <td>+ all time used</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | understanding of presentation        | relevant topics and prioritisation       | own opinions presented | time management | 0 ___ almost nothing | irrelevant | too few | poor | 1 ___ some main points | too few | some | reasonable | 2 ___ main points | some | some correct | fair | 3 ___ all relevant points | most | many correct | efficient | 4 ___ practically all points | well prioritised | + improvement suggestions | + all time used | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>relevant topics and prioritisation</th> <th>own opinions presented</th> <th>opponent's conduct of the discussion</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0 ___ irrelevant</td> <td>too few</td> <td>poor</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 ___ too few</td> <td>some</td> <td>some aspects fine</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 ___ some</td> <td>some correct</td> <td>good</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 ___ most</td> <td>many correct</td> <td>some aspects efficient</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4 ___ well prioritised</td> <td>+ improvement suggestions</td> <td>overall efficient</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | relevant topics and prioritisation | own opinions presented | opponent's conduct of the discussion | 0 ___ irrelevant | too few | poor | 1 ___ too few | some | some aspects fine | 2 ___ some | some correct | good | 3 ___ most | many correct | some aspects efficient | 4 ___ well prioritised | + improvement suggestions | overall efficient | <p>0 ___ concise and correct or no questions asked</p> <p>1 ___ some incorrect, inconclusive or too long</p> <p>2 ___ deeply incorrect or shows deep misconceptions</p> |
| understanding of presentation                                   |  | relevant topics and prioritisation   | own opinions presented                   | time management        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 0 ___ almost nothing  |  | irrelevant                           | too few                                  | poor                   |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 1 ___ some main points  |  | too few                              | some                                     | reasonable             |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 2 ___ main points   |  | some                                 | some correct                             | fair                   |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 3 ___ all relevant points                                       | most   | many correct                         | efficient                                |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 4 ___ practically all points                                    | well prioritised   | + improvement suggestions            | + all time used                          |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| relevant topics and prioritisation                              | own opinions presented   | opponent's conduct of the discussion |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 0 ___ irrelevant  | too few  | poor                                 |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 1 ___ too few   | some   | some aspects fine                    |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 2 ___ some  | some correct   | good                                 |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 3 ___ most  | many correct   | some aspects efficient               |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 4 ___ well prioritised  | + improvement suggestions  | overall efficient                    |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 1 ___ relevant, aimed at resolving unclear points in the report |  |                                      |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
| 2 ___ + short, apt and clear, well prioritized, all time used   |  |                                      |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
|   |  |                                      |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |
|   |  |                                      |  |                        |                 |                      |            |         |      |                        |         |      |            |                   |      |              |      |                           |      |              |           |                              |                  |                           |                 |  |                                    |                        |                                      |                  |         |      |               |      |                   |            |              |      |            |              |                        |                        |                           |                   |   |

NOTES:

## REVIEWER

Start from 1 and add/subtract

$$1 + \square + \square + \square + \square \pm \square - \square = \square$$

| QUESTIONS ASKED  | REVIEW OF REPORT   | REVIEW OF OPPOSITION       | DISCUSSION ANALYSIS        | MISSED POINTS POINTED OUT | ANSWERS TO JURY QUESTIONS |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
|--|--|----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------------|----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------------|--|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------|------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|--|-----------------------|----------------------|------------|------------|-------------------|------|----------------------|------|----------------------------|----------------|--|---|
| 0 ___ too few, mostly irrelevant   | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>evaluation &amp; understanding</th> <th>pros &amp; cons prioritisation</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0 ___ poor/wrong</td> <td>irrelevant</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 ___ superficial</td> <td>partially relevant/correct</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 ___ good</td> <td>mostly correct/prioritised</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 ___ apt, accurate</td> <td>fully adequate, well prioritised</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | evaluation & understanding | pros & cons prioritisation | 0 ___ poor/wrong          | irrelevant                | 1 ___ superficial | partially relevant/correct | 2 ___ good | mostly correct/prioritised | 3 ___ apt, accurate | fully adequate, well prioritised | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>speech evaluation</th> <th>pros &amp; cons prioritisation</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0 ___ poor/wrong</td> <td>irrelevant</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 ___ superficial</td> <td>partially relevant/correct</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 ___ good</td> <td>mostly correct/prioritised</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 ___ apt &amp; accurate</td> <td>fully adequate, well prioritised</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | speech evaluation | pros & cons prioritisation | 0 ___ poor/wrong | irrelevant | 1 ___ superficial | partially relevant/correct | 2 ___ good | mostly correct/prioritised | 3 ___ apt & accurate | fully adequate, well prioritised | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>discussion evaluation</th> <th>correct own opinions</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0 ___ poor</td> <td>irrelevant</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1 ___ superficial</td> <td>some</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 ___ relevant parts</td> <td>many</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 ___ accurate, convincing</td> <td>fully adequate</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | discussion evaluation | correct own opinions | 0 ___ poor | irrelevant | 1 ___ superficial | some | 2 ___ relevant parts | many | 3 ___ accurate, convincing | fully adequate | <p>-1 ___ irrelevant</p> <p>0 ___ none</p> <p>1 ___ relevant, constructive</p> | <p>0 ___ concise and correct or no questions asked</p> <p>1 ___ some incorrect, inconclusive or too long</p> <p>2 ___ deeply incorrect or shows deep misconceptions</p> |
| evaluation & understanding   |  | pros & cons prioritisation |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 0 ___ poor/wrong   |  | irrelevant                 |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 1 ___ superficial  |  | partially relevant/correct |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 2 ___ good   |  | mostly correct/prioritised |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 3 ___ apt, accurate  | fully adequate, well prioritised   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| speech evaluation  | pros & cons prioritisation   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 0 ___ poor/wrong   | irrelevant   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 1 ___ superficial  | partially relevant/correct   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 2 ___ good   | mostly correct/prioritised   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 3 ___ apt & accurate   | fully adequate, well prioritised   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| discussion evaluation  | correct own opinions   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 0 ___ poor   | irrelevant   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 1 ___ superficial  | some   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 2 ___ relevant parts   | many   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 3 ___ accurate, convincing   | fully adequate   |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 1 ___ relevant, meant to clarify unclear points                          |  |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 2 ___ + suitably allotted to Rep & Opp, most time used                   |  |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
| 3 ___ + short, apt and clear, well prioritized, time managed efficiently |  |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |
|  |  |                            |                            |                           |                           |                   |                            |            |                            |                     |                                  |  |                   |                            |                  |            |                   |                            |            |                            |                      |                                  |  |                       |                      |            |            |                   |      |                      |      |                            |                |  |   |

NOTES: